AGROFORESTRY SYSTEMS OF HIGH NATURAL AND CULTURAL VALUE IN EUROPE: CONSTRAINTS, CHALLENGES AND PROPOSAL FOR THE FUTURE

HNV FARMS: Farm types and landscapes valuable for biodiversity, they are managed at low intensity and that retains semi-natural vegetation.

EUROPEAN HNV AGROFORESTRY include: Wood pastures (grazed), Meadows with scattered trees, Bocage and other mosaic-like farmed landscapes

SEMINATURAL LANDSCAPES, but farmed
Although ecological and socioeconomic contexts vary enormously among regions, European agroforestry systems share a common challenge, the low economic profitability because they are usually relegated to less productive lands.
They are currently threatened by either land intensification, what causes progressive loss of trees and extensification/abandonment, what results in excessive thick and lost of their potential productive.
A participatory research project across Europe was conducted to identify main constraints, key challenges and potential innovations to improve the resilience and reinforce their economic profitability and provision of ecosystem services.

Ten national stakeholder groups (N= participants): farmers, NGOs, companies, private and public technical staff, consumers, researchers and policy makers.

Joint discussion and face-to-face interviews, with semi-structure questionnaires were held in...
Fishbone or Ishikawa diagram that summarizes main constraints for Spanish dehesas identified by stakeholders.
Work route

**PERCEPTION of DIFFERENT ASPECTS CONCERNING TO AGROFORESTRY SYSTEMS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aspect</th>
<th>Positive Rate</th>
<th>Negative Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Animal production</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Losses by predation</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crop or pasture quality</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disease and weed control</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diversity of products</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complexity of work</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management costs</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mechanisation</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Originality</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product feasibility</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tree regeneration/survival</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carbon sequestration</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate moderation</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General environment</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Landscape aesthetics</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soil conservation</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water quality</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agricultural biodiversity</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farmers' income</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inheritance and tax</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regulation</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local food supply</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Market</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opportunity for hunting</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship between farmers/owners</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural employment</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subsidy and grant eligibility</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student and social integration</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**QUESTIONNAIRES: EVALUATION OF SERVICES AND DISSERVICES FOR AGROFORESTRY**
WORK ROUTE

QUESTIONNAIRES: PRIORIZACION OF POTENTIAL INNOVATIONS
FACE TO FACE DISCUSSION: AGREEMENT FOR FIELD TEST OF INNOVATIONS PROPOSED
Main Concerns and Challenges

1. Low profitability of HNCV as a key constraint for the future sustainability.
2. New system design and management for new challenges and socio-economic context.
3. To reconcile grazing livestock with tree layer conservation and regeneration.
4. More efficient use of local forage resources to increase the fodder autonomy of the farms.
5. Cost efficient herding, including technology to improve the efficiency of herding.
6. Animal production and Livestock health in extensive semi-natural systems.
7. Conservation of non-productive features, veteran trees and tree species diversity.
8. Public acknowledgment of the cultural value and the ecosystem services provided by HNCV agroforestry.
9. Extension was seen as critical issues in southern countries.
10. Maladapted policy measures for extensive and multipurpose HNCV agroforestry.

Although most of stakeholder groups acknowledged the importance of ecosystems services provided by HNCV agroforestry, they demanded mostly research focused to solve their daily management problems to increase their profitability.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>System</th>
<th>Main concerns</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>Montado: grazed open oak woodlands</td>
<td>Possible negative consequences of shrub encroachment on cork yield and quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>Dehesa: grazed and intercropped oak woodlands</td>
<td>Low profitability, marked seasonality of fodder resources and deficient tree regeneration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>Grazed oak woodlands in Sardinia</td>
<td>The lack of forage availability and quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greece</td>
<td>Grazed valonia oak woodlands</td>
<td>Oak regeneration and poor pasture understory yield/quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>Bocage agroforestry in Brittany (hedgerows integrated with grassland and arable land)</td>
<td>Decrease of hedgerow density and their reduced importance in farming management and ecological services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>Wood pasture and parkland</td>
<td>Re-instituting tree management, balancing the prevention of infilling with natural regeneration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>Grazed wood pastures and grasslands with ancient non-productive trees in Transylvania</td>
<td>Conservation of veteran non-productive trees and of tree species diversity. Need of economically and socially viable strategies to increase tree regeneration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>Flood plain meadows with tree hedgerows</td>
<td>Hedgerows abandonment Lack of interest of farmers for trees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungary</td>
<td>Grazed wood pastures and grasslands with ancient non-productive trees</td>
<td>Infilling of abandoned wood-pastures, and lack of public awareness of their nature and cultural values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>Wood pastures and grazed forests devoted to reindeer husbandry</td>
<td>Adaptation of forest operations to reindeer husbandry</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ConLntental

Romania

Grazed wood pastures and grasslands with ancient non-productive trees in Transylvania

Conservation of veteran non-productive trees and of tree species diversity. Need of economically and socially viable strategies to increase tree regeneration.

Germany

Flood plain meadows with tree hedgerows

Hedgerows abandonment Lack of interest of farmers for trees

Hungary

Grazed wood pastures and grasslands with ancient non-productive trees

Infilling of abandoned wood-pastures, and lack of public awareness of their nature and cultural values

Sweden

Wood pastures and grazed forests devoted to reindeer husbandry

Adaptation of forest operations to reindeer husbandry
The way forward: Innovations proposed

- **Farm profitability**
  - Branding better HNCV products: improving knowledge of customer and tax-payer interests.
  - Product diversification. Surveys to assess the willingness to pay a premium price for agroforestry products.
  - Quality of tree products.

- **System design and management**
  - Design and management of the system to new multiple practices: developing modular models of hedgerow systems.
  - Innovative tree species which can resist livestock.
  - Livestock management: species, races and stocking rates.

- **Protection and regeneration**
  - Protecting trees: Wide range of methods for protecting trees from livestock.
  - Less browser livestock races.
  - Grazing calendar.

- **Pasture quality**
  - Fodder crops: e.g. legume-rich pastures and winter forages adapted to shade.
  - Adapted silviculture: e.g. selection of forage tree/shrub species.

- **Grazing systems and cost efficient herding**
  - Selection of specific livestock breeds
  - Holistic grazing (intensive fast-rotational grazing)
  - Location of facilities (e.g. watering points, supplementary fodder, salt)
  - GPS collar technology and "invisible fencing"

- **Animal production and Health**
  - Control of access to water points and supplementary food.
  - Design of hedgerows to improve shelter.

- **Nature conservation**
  - Choice of livestock species and breed
  - Methods for fire control
  - Improved understanding of the effects on soil carbon
  - Methods of soil protection.

- **Extension**
  - The use of pilot farms
  - Encouragement of local state officials in extension activities.

- **Policy and governance**
  - Payment for historical landscapes
  - New co-operative models for developing agroforestry.
Innovations for HNV agroforestry: some examples

System design, renewal

Adaptations of forest management to promote better conditions for reindeer husbandry: soil scarification, planting with Lodgepole Pine, more and harder pre-commercial thinning and thinning, and forests with longer rotation periods in some areas.

Three-dimensions adaptive design and management of hedgerows to promote ecosystem services (by comparing different bocage structure: age, density, size of hedgerows).

Renewal of hedgerows, with valuation of the potential of harvested biomass and different harvesting methods to finance new tree protection.
Innovations for HNV agroforestry: some examples

Integrating grazing livestock with tree layer conservation and regeneration:

Cost-efficient methods for tree regeneration, included virtual fencing and GPS-based devices, and management practices compatible with tree regeneration.

Cost-efficient methods for tree regeneration

- Grazing exclusion
- Nursery shrubs
- Natural protectors (pruned branches)
- Artificial wire thorny shelters
- Chemical organic repellents
- Design of comprehensive strategies (social participation)
Innovations for HNV agroforestry: some examples

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quality of Pasture / Fodder Autonomy</th>
<th>Grazing schemes. Cost-efficient Herding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Overcome strong seasonality of “natural” forage resources:</td>
<td>Cost-efficient herding. Technology: Invisible fencing; GPS tracking; Multipurpose GPS collar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Lamc rich permanent pastures; Woody Forage Banks</em></td>
<td>More efficient and even use of extensive forage resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase pasture productivity and quality</td>
<td>Livestock species</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Diagram of Pastoreo Rotacional]
innovations for HNV agroforestry: some examples

smart GPS collars

Virtual fencing & Remote shepherding (negative  
  regulation: ultrasonic and electric signals)

Protection of regeneration (inexpensive RFID (Radio  
Frequency IDentification) tags)

Livestock Diseases Control (e.g. transmission of tuberculosis  
  wild ungulates and animals such as wild pigs that cohabit  
  livestock) by keep the domestic animals from drinking  
  the same ponds as the wildlife.

Animal reproductive males without human supervision is  
  a demanded functionality provided by the collar, since  
  movements will be detected, recorded and transmitted to a  
  remote server storage.
Innovations for HNV agroforestry: some examples

Valuing traditional and new marketable products:

Branding strategies to communicate to consumers the high quality and low (or positive) ecological footprint of wood-pasture products.
Elaboration of innovative techniques for the long term production of timber and non-timber agroforestry products;

Integrated analysis of economic and environmental values to incorporate recreational and ecosystem values in public policy;

Modeling and predictive tools to create integrated systems of support for decision making;

Elaboration of policy proposals to reinforce the public environmental goods and services provided by agroforestry of high nature and cultural value; and

Development of effective institutions and governance structures to help value and manage silvopastoral systems.
Acknowledgement

The AGFORWARD project (Grant Agreement N° ) is co-funded by the European Commission, Directorate General for Research & Innovation, within the Framework Programme of RTD, Theme - Biotechnologies, Agriculture & Food. The views and opinions expressed in this report are purely those of the writers and may not in any circumstances be regarded as stating an official position of the European Commission.

Full reports are accessible at AGFORWARD project portal (www.agforward.eu/index.php/en/FarmerNetworks.html).